

Agenda Item 64.

Development Management Ref No	No weeks on day of committee	Parish	Ward	Listed by:
173049	08/08	St Nicholas Hurst	Hurst	Cllr W Smith

Applicant Mrs A Jenkins

Location 1 Nelsons Lane, Hurst **Postcode** RG10 0RR

Proposal Householder application for the proposed raising of existing roof to create a first floor and additional accommodation in roof space, erection of a single storey rear extension, first floor side extension, removal of existing chimney stacks and changes to existing fenestration.

Type Householder

PS Category 633

Officer Ade Balogun

FOR CONSIDERATION BY Planning Committee on 13th December 2017

REPORT PREPARED BY Head of Development Management and Regulatory Services

SUMMARY

The application site is located along the north-western part of Nelsons Lane, which is within the countryside. The existing dwelling is a single storey detached house sited on a corner plot with neighbouring dwellings located to the southern side shared boundary along Nelsons Lane. The dwelling is set in a rectangular shape with a hipped roof and has benefitted from various extensions in the past.

The application site is well screened from the road by matured hedgerows that run along the site boundaries including the north, east and south boundary of the site.

This application is a resubmission of a recent planning application (ref: 171039) which was refused 21st September 2017. There were three reasons for refusal relating to the impact of the development on the countryside; the impact of the development on the character of the area; and the impact of the development on the amenity of the adjoining residential occupier. This current scheme is for virtually the same development as that refused under delegated powers earlier in the year.

Restrictive policies are in place to prevent inappropriate development in the countryside. Policy CP11 of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy states that in order to protect the separate identity of settlements and the environment, proposals outside development limits will not normally be permitted except where they do not lead to excessive encroachment or expansion of development away from the original buildings and, in the case of residential extensions do not result in inappropriate increases in the scale, form or footprint of the original building. The Borough Design Guide provides a guideline figure of a maximum increase of 50% over the original dwelling.

The proposed development would represent an increase in volume from the original dwelling of 272% and is considered to be an inappropriate form of development which would be harmful to the countryside. The increase in the scale and height of the building would be harmful in this countryside setting. The proposed dormer windows would result in a loss of privacy for the adjoining residential occupier and is unacceptable in terms of neighbour amenity.

PLANNING STATUS

- Designated Countryside
- Wind Turbine Safeguarding Zone
- Land Liable to Flood
- Groundwater Protection Zone

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. The proposed development, due to its excessive increase in cumulative volume of the dwelling when compared with the original building, represents a disproportionate addition over and above the size and volume of the original building and would lead to excessive expansion of development away from the original built form; and would result in inappropriate increases in the scale, form and volume of the original building and be harmful to the character and appearance of the application dwelling within its site context and the countryside location contrary to the aims of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy Policy CP11 (2010) and Section 8 of the Borough Design Guide (2012).
2. By virtue of its excessive height, the proposal would have an overly dominating impact on the skyline and street scene to the significant detriment to the character and appearance of the surrounding area, contrary to the aims of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy Policy CP1 and CP3 (2010) and the Wokingham Borough Managing Development Delivery Plan Policies CC01 and CC03 (2014).
3. The proposed development due to the location of the proposed rear roofslope dormers (south-west facing) and separation distance between the rear elevation of the host dwelling and the shared common boundary line with the neighbouring dwelling No. 2 Nelsons Lane, which fall short of the set guidance of the Borough Design Guide, would result in overlooking across and into the rear garden space of the neighbouring dwelling. This is in breach of the Policy CP3 of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy (2010) and the Design Guidance R23 of the Wokingham Borough Design Guide (2012).

PLANNING HISTORY

Application No.	Description	Decision & Date
1990/72	Additions-2 bedrooms, bathroom, WC, lounge & kitchen	Approved – 21/12/1972
F/2004/2900	Single storey extension, dormer and roof windows to front loft conversion	Refused - 15/11/2004
F/2004/3486	Single storey front porch extension	Approved - 18/01/2005

153272	Proposed erection of a part single storey part two storey front and rear extension, conversion of roof space to habitable accommodation and addition of front and rear dormer roof extensions Single storey detached house with hipped roof.	Refused 31/03/2016	-
171039	proposed raising of existing roof to create a first floor and additional accommodation in roof space, erection of a single storey rear extension, first floor side extension, removal of existing chimney stacks and changes to existing fenestration	Refused 21/09/2017	

CONSULTATION RESPONSES	
WBC Ecology	No objection
WBC Highways	No objection

REPRESENTATIONS	
St Nicholas Hurst Parish Council	Object to the proposal - it represents over-development of the site and would have a negative and harmful impact on the street scene of this area and should be refused.
Ward Member(s)	Cllr W Smith has called the scheme into committee on the basis that it would not be unacceptable in terms of countryside impact/harm.
Neighbours	One representation was received from neighbouring dwelling No. 2 Nelsons Lane objecting to the proposed development on the basis of impact on local character and overlooking into private rear garden space.

PLANNING POLICY
<p>National Policy National Planning Policy Framework 2012</p> <p>Wokingham Borough Core Strategy policies: CP1 – Sustainable development CP3 – General Principles for Development CP7 – Biodiversity CP9 – Scale and location of development proposals CP11 - Proposals outside development limits including countryside</p> <p>Managing Development Delivery Local Plan (MDD LP) policies CC01 – Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development CC02 – Development limits CC03 – Green Infrastructure, Trees and Landscaping CC04 – Sustainable Design and construction CC07 – Parking CC09 – Development and Flood Risk</p> <p>Supplementary Planning Documents Borough Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document CIL Guidance + 123 List A Design for Hurst - Village Design Statement</p>

PLANNING ISSUES

Principle of Development:

The National Planning Policy Framework has an underlying presumption in favour of sustainable development, which is carried through to the local Development Plan. The Managing Development Delivery Local Plan Policy CC01 states that planning applications that accord with the policies in the Development Plan for Wokingham Borough will be approved without delay, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

The site is located within the countryside. Policy CP11 of the Wokingham Borough Council Core Strategy states that in order to protect the separate identity of settlements and the environment, proposals outside development limits will not normally be permitted except where they do not lead to excessive encroachment or expansion of development away from the original buildings and in the case of residential extensions, do not result in inappropriate increases in the scale, form or footprint of the original building.

Policy CP3 of the Core Strategy states that development must be appropriate in terms of its scale of activity, mass, layout, built form, height, materials and character to the area in which it is located and must be of high quality design without detriment to the amenities of adjoining land uses and occupiers.

The Borough Design Guide (SPD) June 2012, Section 8 (8.5.4 – Extensions and additions) states that, inter alia:

Extensions may be permissible provided that the scale, form and footprint does not have an unacceptable impact upon the countryside.

And that:

A 50% increase in volume for a 1 storey development is acceptable when compared with the original building

The application is for an identical proposal to the scheme submitted and refused under Planning Application Ref No: 171039 on the basis of harm to the countryside, the character of the area and impact upon neighbour amenity. Whilst there are no changes to material considerations that would affect the determination of this application since the previous application i.e. no policy changes, screening boundary treatments are the same, no other development since built in the immediate vicinity etc, the application has been assessed on its own merits as outlined below.

Impact on the Countryside:

The dwelling is located outside of settlement boundaries within a rural location. The centre of Twyford is approximately 3km to the north and the centre of Wokingham approximately 4km to the south. Although the dwelling is set along a row of three properties, they are low level properties, well screened from the street. Aside from these dwellings there is sparse development in the area, with the immediate context consisting of fields, some agricultural buildings and narrow country lanes.

The original dwelling as built on site would have been a modest single storey dwelling, with a volume of 185 square metres (sqm). Since it was built, there have been a number of applications to increase the size of the dwelling which are reported below.

Planning permission was granted in 1972 (application reference: 1990/72) for an extension which increased the width of the dwelling from 8m in width to 18m. This extension increased the volume of the building to 445 sqm, an increase of 140% from the original.

A later application for a single storey extension and dormer windows (application reference: F/2004/2900) was refused on the grounds that it constituted inappropriate development in the countryside. The officer's report stated that the proposal would have resulted in a cumulative increase in volume of 190% over the original dwelling. A revised proposal for a smaller porch extension was approved in 2005 (application F/2004/3486) but was never implemented.

In 2016, planning permission was refused for the erection of a part single storey part two storey front and rear extension, conversion of roof space to habitable accommodation and addition of front and rear dormer roof extensions (application reference: 153272). This application would have resulted in an increase in volume of approximately 300% over the volume of the original dwelling.

This current proposal would result in a single storey rear extension of approximately 3m depth, 3.5m width and 2.8m in height projecting into the rear garden. It also proposes a proposed part single part two storey front extension including the raising of existing roof to create a first floor and habitable loft space would result in an increase in the existing dwelling house roof ridge height of approximately 1.5m. The resulting roof form of the proposed development would incorporate the insertion of two dormer windows with pitched roofs to the front and three dormer windows with pitched roofs to the rear roof slope. Overall, the resulting volume of the building would be 689 sqm, which would be an increase of 272% compared to the original dwelling.

Policy CP11 of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy states that in order to protect the separate identity of settlements and the environment, proposals outside development limits will not normally be permitted except where they do not lead to excessive encroachment or expansion of development away from the original buildings and, in the case of residential extensions do not result in inappropriate increases in the scale, form or footprint of the original building.

Following on from the Core Strategy, The Borough Design Guide provides more detailed advice relating to development in the countryside, including a guideline figure for extensions of a total maximum increase of 50% over the volume of the original dwelling. Whilst noted that this a guideline figure, the proposed 272% increase in volume is clearly significantly in excess of the Borough Design Guide. The property has already been extended significantly beyond the 50% volumetric guidance, and accordingly any further extensions should be modest in scale, borne out by the planning history for the site which includes recent refusals for large extensions to the dwelling.

As described above, the 1972 extension increased the width of the dwelling from 8m to 18m, and the extensions proposed in this application represents further expansion away from the original building and would be a disproportionate addition over and

above the size and volume of the original building which would be detriment to the countryside setting of the dwelling. The increase in the height of the building is discussed in detail below, but this would further add to the cumulative increase in size and volume of the dwelling and would therefore result in disproportionate additions to the building, constituting unacceptable development in the countryside.

In summary, the proposed development, due to its excessive increase in cumulative volume of the dwelling when compared with the original building, represents a disproportionate addition over and above the size and volume of the original building and would lead to excessive expansion of development away from the original built form; and would result in inappropriate increases in the scale, form and volume of the original building and be harmful to the character and appearance of the application dwelling within its site context and the countryside location contrary to the aims of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy Policy CP11 (2010) and Section 8 of the Borough Design Guide (2012).

Impact on the Character of the Area:

As described above, the site has a rural setting; there is sparse development in the vicinity of the site and the closest residential properties, including the application site, are single storey. The dwelling is currently well screened by existing vegetation and even though it is located at the junction of Nelsons Lane and Islandstone Lane, is not prominent from public vantage points. The application proposes to raise the ridge height of the dwelling by 1.5m to allow habitable accommodation at first floor level. In addition, it proposes a number of dormer windows and a glazed two storey feature above the front entrance which serve to attract attention to the building compared to the existing plain roof form. As such, the increase in height and additions to the roof would make the building much more visible from public vantage points and prominent in the streetscene. It would be out of keeping with the existing pleasant rural setting, the character of the existing development in the area and harmful to the streetscene.

By virtue of its excessive height, the proposal would have an overly dominating impact on the skyline and street scene to the significant detriment to the character and appearance of the surrounding area, contrary to the aims of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy Policy CP1 and CP3 (2010) and the Wokingham Borough Managing Development Delivery Plan Policies CC01 and CC03 (2014).

Impact on Neighbouring Residential Amenity:

No. 2 Nelsons Lane is the nearest neighbouring dwelling to the application site and is located directly to the south. Nos. 1 and 2 are both set at angles to the road, and No. 1 is set perpendicular to No. 2. As described above, the application proposes to raise the height of the application dwelling to create habitable accommodation consisting of 4 bedrooms and a bathroom at first floor level and insert three dormer windows in the elevation facing No. 2's private rear amenity space. One of the windows would serve a bathroom and could therefore reasonably be expected to be obscure glazed; however the other two windows would serve proposed bedrooms 1 and 3. These are the sole windows serving these bedrooms.

In accordance with the Borough Design Guide, in order to maintain privacy and limit the sense of enclosure, a back to flank (i.e. from the rear of the new/extended dwelling to the flank of the existing neighbouring dwelling) separation distance of 12m is required. In this instance, the separation distance between bedroom 1 at the rear of the dwelling to the boundary with No. 2 would be approximately 8.5m. This is significantly below the

minimum required by the Design Guide and would result in unacceptable direct overlooking into the rear of the neighbouring property, as well as a sense of enclosure given the limited scale of development in the open countryside. Although there is a hedge between the neighbouring properties, it is not at a height that would sufficiently prevent overlooking and in any event could not be relied on to block views in perpetuity.

As such, the proposed development due to the location of the proposed rear roofslope dormers and separation distance between the rear elevation of the host dwelling and the shared common boundary line with the neighbouring dwelling No. 2 Nelsons Lane, which fall short of the set guidance of the Borough Design Guide, would result in overlooking across and into the rear garden space of the neighbouring dwelling. This is in breach of the Policy CP3 of the Wokingham Borough Adopted Core Strategy (2010) and the Design Guidance R23 of the Wokingham Borough Design Guide (2012).

Amenity Space:

The proposal would increase the footprint of the dwelling however, the remaining amenity space would be of a size that would accord with the Borough Design Guide and would be able to accommodate typical garden activities. As such, no harmful impact is considered to occur.

Highway Access and Parking Provision:

Three parking spaces are shown on the submitted plans, and it is considered that at least three vehicles can be accommodated within the curtilage of the dwelling. As such the level of parking proposed is adequate to serve the property. Access is not affected by the proposal.

Ecology:

A Bat Survey has been submitted with the application, which confirms that the risk of bats being affected by the development is low. The Council's Ecologist has reviewed the report and agrees that the development would be not be unacceptable in relation to bats. There is no objection on this basis, subject to a standard informative in the event that the application were approved.

Drainage and Flooding:

The site is located within Flood Zone 2 (Medium risk of flooding). In accordance with the Environment Agency's standing advice, it would be expected that the application be submitted with a Flood Risk Assessment which sets out what proposed floor levels would be in relation to the estimated flood level. Although this has not been submitted, the Council's Drainage Officer advises that this further information could be sought or conditioned were the development acceptable in all other respects. As such, it is not proposed that this be included as a reason for refusal.

CONCLUSION

The proposed 272% increase in cumulative volume of the dwelling represents a disproportionate addition over and above the size and volume of the original building and would lead to excessive expansion of development away from the original built form, resulting in an inappropriate increase in the scale, form and volume of the original building. It would harmful to the character and appearance of the application dwelling within its site context and the countryside location. It would also result in an unacceptable degree of overlooking and loss of privacy to the neighbouring dwelling.

The application is therefore recommended for refusal.

CONTACT DETAILS		
Service	Telephone	Email
Development Management and Regulatory Services	0118 974 6000	development.control@wokingham.gov.uk